

**Benchmark County
Comparison Suggests
Livingston County Seniors
may be Underserved by
Home and Community
Based Services**

**A comparison of
senior service levels in
Livingston and Monroe
Counties**

**Prepared by
Area Agency on Aging 1-B
April 2019**

Benchmark County Comparison Suggests Livingston County Seniors may be Underserved by Home and Community Based Services

Livingston County's "Aging Network" consists primarily of agencies providing home and community-based services funded with state and federal Older Americans Act dollars. These organizations consistently earn high customer satisfaction ratings from the older Livingston County residents they serve and have earned recognition for effective service delivery. However, it has been documented that there are many older adults seeking services whose needs are not being fully met due to limited resources that foster wait lists, service rationing, and under serving. This begs the question: How well is the demand for Aging Network services being met in Livingston County?

This report attempts to answer that question by examining the level of services provided to the senior population in a 'sister county' with comparable socioeconomic demographics: Monroe County, Michigan. The study benchmarks Monroe County serving levels for *six services (Congregate and Home Delivered Meals, Adult Day Care, Elder Abuse Prevention, Legal Assistance, and Outreach/Resource Advocacy)* provided in both counties that operate under the same Aging and Adult Service Agency service definition, as reported to the Area Agency on Aging and documented in the National Aging Program Information System (NAPIS). In addition, the report identified all services that are provided through the respective county's Aging Network that are not provided in the other county.

The finding is that far more older Monroe County residents receive key services than Livingston County seniors, despite the fact that there are an estimated 9,000 fewer Monroe County seniors (49387 vs. 40467, source: SEMCOG). Livingston County residents also receive significantly fewer units of service per senior than Monroe County seniors. In addition, there are many more unique services that exist in Monroe County than are available to older Livingston County residents. This inequity exists despite strong financial support by the Livingston County Board of Commissioner allocations of matching funds for key state and federally funded home and community senior services. The disparity is largely explained by the presence of a countywide senior citizens property tax millage in Monroe County that raises \$3.7 million to enhance their Aging Network service delivery system.

County Aging Network Service Unit Comparison - 2018

	Total Service Units	Service Units per 1,000 Seniors
Livingston County	262,040	4,547
Monroe County	912,853	8,799

DEMOGRAPHIC COMPARISON

While the Livingston County age 60 and older population is approximately 22% larger than Monroe County's, and key demographics of the population receiving home and community-based services funded through each county's Aging Sector follow are similar. *The key difference is that service recipients with characteristics that are associated with a higher incidence of need (low income, living alone, advanced age, and minority status) are served at a slightly higher proportion.*

Senior Population Demographics

Data	Monroe County	Livingston County
Median Age	41.9	42.5
Total Population estimate 2019	149,004	194,193
Population Age 60+	40,467	49,389
Percent of Population Age 60 and Older	27.2%	25.4%
Living Alone Age 65 and Older	5,956	9,008
Percent of Population Age 60 and Older Living Alone	14.7%	18.2%
Age 85 and Older	2,592	2,611
Percent of Population Age 85 and Older	6.4%	5.3%

Sources: SEMCOG 2045 Regional Development Forecast, US Census Bureau American Community Survey 2016

The SEMCOG 2045 Regional Development Forecast population estimates project that in 2010 there are 36 Livingston County residents age 100 and older

In 2015 there were 9.7 family caregiver age individuals for every care recipient; in 2019 there are only 8.2 caregiver age individuals for every one care recipient; and in 2035 the ratio will be 2.4 to one

FINDINGS FROM THE COMPARISON OF OLDER ADULT PARTICIPATION IN ELEVEN BENCHMARK PROGRAMS IN MONROE AND LIVINGSTON COUNTIES

Livingston and Monroe County service and program participant data for this comparison was reported to the Area Agency on Aging 1-B by county level service providers. There were eleven key senior service categories that were used in this analysis. Only two of the eleven Livingston County programs, Volunteer Caregiver and Adult Day Care, reported serving levels that were higher per 1,000 seniors than Monroe County. The number of service hours per 1,000 seniors for four Monroe County services included in this study were more than four times greater than provided for Livingston County seniors (Resource Advocacy, Legal Assistance, Chore Services and in-home assistance such as personal care and housekeeping that are offered through the Community Living Program). The Monroe County serving level advantage ranged between 160% - 413% higher. The Volunteer Caregiver and Adult Day Care programs administered by Livingston Catholic Charities offered twice as many hours of service than their Monroe County counterparts.

The comparison of the actual number of program participants receiving services showed a similar pattern with only three Livingston County programs, Volunteer Caregiver, Elder Abuse Prevention and Resource Advocacy, serving more people per 1,000 seniors. For the eight services where Monroe programs served a greater proportion of seniors, the range was between 170% (adult day care) and 856% (chore service) higher. The Livingston County program serving the least number of seniors, Home Injury Control, serves 1 in every 760 older Livingston County residents. The Monroe County Home Injury Control program served 1 in 500 older Monroe County residents in 2018. Home Delivered Meals, Livingston County's largest senior program by units of service, delivers 3.1 meals annually for every Livingston County Senior. In Monroe County about five meals are delivered for every older Monroe County resident.

A bright spot for Livingston County seniors is that three of the four services provided by Livingston Catholic Charities exceed at least one of the serving level performance measures of their Monroe County counterparts despite having access to less funding. The fourth Livingston Catholic Charities program, Adult Day Care, only serves fewer seniors because there are three Adult Day Care programs serving Monroe County. The 54 Livingston County residents served in 2018 is higher than any single Monroe County Adult Day Care program. These findings suggest that Livingston Catholic Charities offer Livingston County seniors superior program management and do more with less.

Detailed comparison data for the eleven individual services are provided below:

ADULT DAY CARE

Monroe County provided half as many service units as Livingston County per 1,000 seniors despite the availability of additional senior millage funds. The 75 Monroe County seniors participating in an Adult Day Care program were served by one of three programs available to older county residents; no single center served more than 39 residents

Adult Day Care							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	6,999	424	50%		75	1.85	170%
Livingston	17,171	142			54	1.09	

CONGREGATE MEALS

Monroe County served more than twice as many Congregate Meals as Livingston County per 1,000 seniors. Livingston County served an average of 49 meals per participant, compared to 40 per Monroe County participant.

Congregate Meals							
Number of Meals and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Meals	Meals/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	38,781	958	239%		687	16.98	178%
Livingston	19,821	401			471	9.54	

ELDER ABUSE PREVENTION

Monroe County provided three times more hours of Elder Abuse Prevention services per 1,000 seniors than Livingston County and served three times more seniors.

Elder Abuse Prevention							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	461	11	337%		381	9.42	294%
Livingston	167	3			158	3.20	

HOME DELIVERED MEALS

Monroe County served 60% more Home Delivered Meals (Meals on Wheels) per 1,000 seniors and delivered to more than twice as many seniors than Livingston County.

Home Delivered Meals							
Number of Meals and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Meals	Meals/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	202,243	4998	160%		1114	27.53	225%
Livingston	154,599	3130			603	12.21	

RESOURCE ADVOCACY

Monroe County provided more than four times as many service units as Livingston County per 1,000 seniors while Livingston County served 20% more seniors. Monroe County participants received an average of six hours of service compared to 1.3 hours for Livingston County participants. This difference suggests that the Monroe program carries a more intense caseload and/or maintains a relationship with participants for a longer period of time.

Resource Advocacy							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	4,737	117	413%		802	20	97%
Livingston	1,400	28			1014	21	

VOLUNTEER CAREGIVER

Livingston County has a strong Volunteer Caregiver program that served seven times more seniors and provided more than twice the amount of service as Monroe County, which has a fledgling program.

Volunteer Caregiver							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	744	18	48%		8	0.20	16%
Livingston	1,897	38			60	1.21	

LEGAL SERVICE

Monroe County provided more than four times as many service units as Livingston County per 1,000 seniors and served almost four times as many older Livingston County residents. Both programs produce an average of three hours of legal consultation per participant.

Legal Services							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	2,903	72	404%		878	21.70	370%
Livingston	878	18			290	5.87	

CHORE SERVICE

Monroe County provided more than four times as many service units as Livingston County per 1,000 seniors and over eight times as many older Livingston County residents.

Chore Services							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	5,567	138	406%		456	11.27	856%
Livingston	1,674	34			65	1.32	

HOME INJURY CONTROL

Monroe County provided more than four times as many service units as Livingston County per 1,000 seniors and over eight times as many older Livingston County residents.

Home Injury Control							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	259	6	245%		81	2.00	309%
Livingston	129	3			32	0.65	

COMMUNITY LIVING PROGRAM IN-HOME CARE

Monroe County provided more than four times as many hours of in-home care, mostly personal care and homemaking, as Livingston County per 1,000 seniors and served almost four times as many older Livingston County residents.

Community Living Program In-Home Care							
Hours of Service and Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
	Hours	Hours/1000	Difference		Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe	143,159	3538	413%		293	7.24	376%
Livingston	42,341	857			95	1.92	

COMMUNITY CARE MANAGEMENT AND CASE COORDINATION

Monroe County served almost five times as many Livingston County per 1,000 seniors with Community Care Management and/or Case Coordination.

Community Care Management and Case Coordination							
Number of Seniors Served per 1,000 Seniors							
					Seniors	Seniors/1000	Difference
Monroe					402	9.93	486%
Livingston					101	2.04	

SERVICES THAT ARE UNIQUE TO EACH COUNTY

The study identified services that were present in one county's Aging Network service delivery system, but not the other, and identified their primary funding source when possible. Six senior-specific services were unique to Monroe County and funded by the county senior millage. No senior-only programs were identified in Livingston County that were not also present in Monroe County. These unique services are listed in the table below.

Service	Present in Monroe County Only	Primary Funding Source
Counseling	X	Senior Millage
Senior Health Van	X	Senior Millage
Unmet Emergency Needs*	X	Senior Millage
Utility Assistance*	X	Senior Millage
Project Ramp	X	Senior Millage
Self and Family Behavioral Healthcare	X	Senior Millage

* Millage funds support this service to seniors who may not qualify for assistance through the Michigan Department of Health and Human Services program

CONCLUSION

Livingston County seniors have a smaller percentage and fewer overall numbers of seniors who have social and economic characteristics that are associated with greater needs. Despite having approximately 9,000 more seniors than Monroe County, one would still expect that the overall demand for services would be modestly higher among Monroe County seniors. That difference would not explain the utilization of service units in Monroe County being twice as great as in Livingston County.

Clearly, senior needs are better met by Monroe County's Aging Network, and it is likely many Livingston County seniors who do not have the resources to pay for needed services at private market

rates are going without. Two examples where this can be seen are 1) the full occupancy of the Livingston Catholic Charities' adult day care program while Monroe's programs have vacancies; and 2) the 64 older Livingston County residents on the AAA 1-B Community Living Program wait list (with needs mostly for personal care, homemaking and assisted transportation), while no Monroe County residents are on a wait list. The Monroe County Senior Millage assessment of up to 0.7 mils that raises approximately \$3.7 million annually is plainly the factor that is responsible for the inequity.